Agenda Date: 2/06/09 Agenda Item: 2A



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, NJ 07102 www.nj.gov/bpu

ΕN	EF	≀GY

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2009 – AUCTION RESULTS

DECISION AND ORDER

DOCKET NO. ER08050310

(SERVICE LIST ATTACHED)

BY THE BOARD:

By Order dated January 20, 2009, the Board of Public Utilities ("Board") approved, with modifications and clarifications, the joint Basic Generation Service ("BGS") proposal of Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G"), Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L"), Conectiv Power Delivery ("Conectiv") and Rockland Electric Company ("Rockland") (collectively the "EDCs"), for two descending clock auctions to secure the EDCs' BGS electricity requirements for the period beginning June 1, 2008 ("January 20 Order"). In an attempt to mitigate the risk to ratepayers, the Board directed the EDCs to procure approximately one-third of the EDCs' current fixed-price ("BGS-FP") BGS load for a 36-month period. The Board also found that a 12-month procurement period for the EDCs' hourly load BGS customers ("BGS-CIEP") is appropriate and reasonable. In its January 20 Order, the Board also committed to review the results of the BGS-FP Auction and the BGS-CIEP Auction (collectively the "BGS Auctions" or "Auctions") each in its entirety and certify the results of each auction for all of the EDCs, or for none of them, no later than the second business day after the last Auction closes.

The results of the BGS Auctions, if approved by the Board, will then be converted into revised BGS rates for customers beginning June 1, 2009. This is the seventh year that the Board has authorized a similar auction process to secure BGS supply.

The Auction Manager responsible for conducting the 2009 Auctions was National Economic Research Associates ("NERA"). NERA brings expertise in the conduct of simultaneous descending clock auctions in the energy and telecommunications industries, and was the Auction Manager for

¹Approximately two-third of the EDC's BGS-FP requirements are already under contract through May 31, 2010 and one-third through May 31, 2011 as a result of the 2007 and 2008 BGS-FP Auctions.

the seven previous BGS Auctions. The Auctions were continuously monitored by Staff from the Division of Energy, as well as by the Board's consultant, Boston Pacific Company, Inc. ("BP"). BP was retained to assist the Board in this process. BP has experience with simultaneous descending clock auctions and energy industry experience.

BGS-FP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-FP Auction began on February 2, 2009 and ended on February 4, 2008 after 26 rounds with all of the EDCs' 54 tranches² secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

	Closing Price <u>¢/Kwh</u>	Total Tranches <u>Available</u>
CONECTIV	10.536	7
JCP&L	10.351	17
PSE&G	10.372	29
ROCKLAND	11.270	1

A list of the BGS-FP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order. This is an increase in the number of winning bidders from 8 in the 2008 Auction to 10 winning bidders in the 2009 Auction.

BGS-CIEP AUCTION SUMMARY

The BGS-CIEP Auction began on January 30, 2009, and ended on February 4, 2009 after 57 rounds with all of the EDCs' 40 tranches³ secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

	Closing Price \$/Mw-day	Total Tranches Secured
CONECTIV	215.00	5
JCP&L	203.92	11
PSE&G	203.25	23
ROCKLAND	215.25	1

²A tranche in the BGS-FP Auction is approximately 100 Mw.

³A tranche in the BGS-CIEP Auction is equivalent to approximately 75 Mw.

A list of the BGS-CIEP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order. This is an increase in the number of winning bidders from 4 in the 2008 Auction to 5 winning bidders in the 2009 Auction.

Auction Oversight

NERA has provided a confidential post-Auction checklist form evaluating how the BGS-FP and BGS-CIEP Auctions were conducted. NERA's analysis supporting acceptance of the Auction results indicates, in part, that:

- no issues nor questions were left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created uncertainty for bidders;
- no procedural problems nor errors were observed during the Auctions; all communication protocols were followed;
- no hardware nor software problems with the Auctions and communication systems were observed;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- all guidelines for setting or changing the Auction parameters were followed;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions in a material manner;
- communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there was no evidence that bidders were rushed;
- no complaints were received from the bidders;
- the Auctions were carried out in a fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of collusion nor gaming by the bidders;
- public and sensitive information were treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions that materially affected the Auctions; and
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-FP and BGS-CIEP loads.

BP has also provided the Board with a confidential post-Auction evaluation form for the BGS-FP and BGS-CIEP Auctions, as well as a supplemental checklist reviewing how the Auctions were conducted. BP's analysis is consistent with NERA's analysis. Both consultants recommend that the Board accept the final Auction results.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The independent NERA and BP analyses are consistent with each other and indicate that the Auctions proceeded without meaningful interruption, according to the Board-approved Auction Rules, in an acceptably fair and transparent manner, and they both recommend that the Board certify the Auction results. Staff assigned to oversee the Auctions has also briefed the Board on the conduct and results of each Auction.

After reviewing the checklists and evaluation forms from NERA and BP, and discussing the results and conduct of the Auctions with Staff, NERA and BP, the Board FINDS that:

- bidders had sufficient information to prepare for the Auctions;
 information was generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable, and the timetable was adjusted appropriately as needed;
- there were no Auction issues or questions left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created material uncertainty for bidders;
- from what could be observed, there were no procedural problems nor errors with the Auctions, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols between bidders and the Auction Manager were adhered to;
- appropriate data back-up procedures were planned and carried out;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols among the EDCs, NERA, Staff, the Board, and BP were followed during the Auctions;
- protocols were followed for decisions regarding changes in the Auction parameters (e.g. volume, load cap, bid decrements);
- the calculations (e.g. for bid decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the Auction software were double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions;
- from what could be observed, the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there were no complaints received from the bidders about the process;
- the Auctions were carried out in an acceptably fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of gaming on the part of bidders;
- there was no evidence of collusion among bidders;
- information was made public in an appropriate manner, and from what could be observed sensitive information was treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions (e.g. changes in market environment) that materially affected the Auctions in unanticipated ways);
- there are no concerns with the Auctions' outcome with regard to any specific EDC(s);
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-FP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Based on the foregoing, the Board <u>HEREBY CERTIFIES</u> the final results of the BGS-FP and BGS-CIEP Auctions in their entirety, and subsequently <u>APPROVES</u> the closing prices for each EDC. Furthermore, the Board <u>HEREBY ORDERS</u> the EDCs 1) to execute the necessary documents with the winning bidders, including the BGS Master Supply Agreements, 2) to implement the BGS rates resulting from the Auctions beginning June 1, 2009, and 3) to file tariff sheets reflecting those rates by March 1, 2009.

Consistent with past Board practice, the Board is releasing the names of the winning bidders at this time. However, at this time, the Board will not release the specific tranche and service area details for each successful bidder, so as not to compromise the position of the winning bidders in the marketplace. The Board plans to make this additional information public prior to June 1, 2009.

DATED: 2/6/09

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

JEANNE M. FOX

FREDERICK F. BUTLER COMMISSIONER

COMMISSIONER

FIORDALISO

ELIZABETH RANDALL COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

COMMISSIONER

SECRETARY

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public

Utilities

ATTACHMENT A

I/M/O The Provision Of Basic Generation Service For The Period Beginning June 1, 2009 Docket No. ER08050310

Auction Winners Approved by the Board of Public Utilities on February 6, 2009.

BGS-FP Auction Winners

Conectiv Energy Supply, Inc.
Consolidated Edison Energy, Inc.
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
FPL Energy Power Marketing, Inc.
Hess Corporation
J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corporation
Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc.
PPL EnergyPlus, LLC
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC
Sempra Energy Trading LLC.

BGS-CIEP Auction Winners

Consolidated Edison Energy, Inc.
Dominion Retail, Inc.
FPL Energy Power Marketing, Inc.
Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc.
PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC.

Board of Public Utilities I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service for the Period Beginning June 1, 2009 Docket No. ER08050310

Service List

BPU STAFF

Kristi Izzo, Secretary Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, NJ 07102

Mark Beyer Chief Economist Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, New Jersey 07102

Frank Perrotti
Division of Energy
Board of Public Utilities
Two Gateway Center
Newark, New Jersey 07102

John Garvey
Office of the Economist
Board of Public Utilities
Two Gateway Center
Newark, New Jersey 07102

Alice Bator, Chief Division of Energy Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, New Jersey 07102

Sam Wolfe, Chief Counsel Counsel's Office Board of Public Utilities Two Gateway Center Newark, New Jersey 07102

DAG

Elise Goldblat
Division of Law
Dept. of Law & Public Safety
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, New Jersey 07102

Babette Tenzer
Division of Law
Dept. of Law & Public Safety
124 Halsey Street
P.O. Box 45029
Newark, NJ 07102

RATEPAYER ADVOCATE

Stephanie A. Brand, Director Ratepayer Advocate & Director Division of Ratepayer Advocate 31 Clinton Street, 11th Floor P.O. Box 46005 Newark, New Jersey 07102 Paul Flanagan Ratepayer Advocate & Director Division of Ratepayer Advocate 31 Clinton Street, 11th Floor P.O. Box 46005

Newark, New Jersey 07102

Ami Morita Division of Ratepayer Advocate 31 Clinton Street, 11th Floor P.O. Box 46005 Newark, New Jersey 07101

Diane Schulze
Division of Ratepayer Advocate
31 Clinton Street, 11th Floor
P.O. Box 46005
Newark, New Jersey 07101

ACE

Greg Marquis.
Bulk Power Supply Management
Pepco Holdings, Inc.
701 Ninth Street NW
Washington, DC 20068-0001

Mark Mucci, Esq. Saul Ewing LLP One Riverfront Plaza, 5th Floor Newark, NJ 07102-5490

Joe Janocha Atlantic City Electric Co. 5100 Harding Highway Mays Landing, NJ 08330

Peter Schaub Pepco Holdings, Inc. 701 Ninth Street NW Washington, DC 20068-0001

JCP&L

Michael J. Filippone JCP&L 300 Madison Avenue PO Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911

Kevin Connolly JCP&L 300 Madison Avenue PO Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911 Larry Sweeney JCP&L 300 Madison Ave, P.O. Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911

Marc B. Lasky, Esq. Thelen Reid & Priest, LLP 200 Campus Drive, St. 210 Florham Park, NJ 07932

PSE&G

Tony Robinson
Public Service Electric & Gas Co.
80 Park Plaza, T8C
Newark, NJ 07101

Steve Huber Public Service Electric & Gas Co. 80 Park Plaza, T8C Newark, NJ 07101

Frances I. Sundheim, Esq. Public Service Electric & Gas Co. 80 Park Plaza T8C Newark, NJ 07101

ROCKLAND

John L. Carley, Esq. Consolidated Edison Co. of NY, Inc. 4 Irving Place New York, NY 10003

James C. Meyer, Esq.
Riker, Danzig, Scherer, Hyland & Perretti,
LLP
Headquarters Plaza
One Speedwell Avenue
Morristown, NJ 07962

David Hernandez Orange & Rockland Utilities 390 West Rt. 59 Spring Valley, NY 10977-5320

Kevin Jones Orange & Rockland Utilities 390 West Rt. 59 Spring Valley, NY 10977-5320

SUPPLIERS

Geoffrey Allen AEP Service Corp. 155 W. Nationwide Blvd. St. 500 Columbus, OH 43215

Board of Public Utilities I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service for the Period Beginning June 1, 2009 Docket No. ER08050310 Service List

Scott Brown
Exelon Energy (PECO)

2315 Enterprise Drive Westchester, IL 60154-5811

David Koenig Allegheny Energy 909 3rd Avenue, 33rd Floor New York, NY 10022

Eric Konopacky Constellation Power Source, Inc. 111 Market Place, Suite 500 Baltimore, MD 21202

Brian Liu Constellation Power Source, Inc. 111 Market Place, Suite 500 Baltimore, MD 21202

Murry Weaver Entergy Power Marketing Corp. Parkwood Two Building, Suite 500 10055 Grogan's Mill Road The Woodlands, TX 77380

David Samuels Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc. 2000 Westchester Ave. Purchase, NY 10577

Deborah Hart Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc. 2000 Westchester Ave. Trading Floor Purchase, NY 10577

Catherine Flax Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc. 1585 Broadway, 4th Floor New York, NY 10036

Sharon Weber PP&L Energy Plus 2 North 9th Street TW 20 Allentown, PA 18101

Gary Sorenson PSEG Power 80 Park Plaza, T-21A Newark, NJ 07102

Shawn P. Leyden PSEG Energy Resources & Trade 80 Park Place, T-19 Newark, NJ 07102 Ken Salamone Sempra Energy Trading Corp.

58 Commerce Road Stamford, CT 06902

Bonnie Graziano Pepco Energy Services, Inc. 543 Valley Road Montclair, NJ 07043

Marilena Marrelli Sempra Energy Trading Corp. 58 Commerce Road Stanford, CT 06902

Ike Gibbs Reliant Energy, Inc. 379 Thornal Street Fifth Floor Edison, NJ 08837

Ken Gfroerer Reliant Energy RR1 Box 246 Stahlstown, PA 15687

Bill Rice Reliant Energy 1111 Louisiana Street Houston, TX 77002

Shalin Shah Reliant Energy 1111 Louisiana Street Location 1971D Houston, TX 77002

Leah Gibbons Reliant Energy LLC 324 Cedar Lane Rockville, MD 20851

Glenn Riepl AEP Energy Services 1 Riverside Plaza, 14th Fl. Columbus, OH 43215-2373

Angelo Chambrone Select Energy NY, Inc. 507 Plum Street Syracuse, NY 13204

Kuljinder Chase Energy Trading Merril Lynch Capital Services 4 World Financial Center 7th fl. New York, NY 10080 Leonard E. Navitsky Select Energy, Inc. 3301 Cherokee St. Emmaus, PA 18049

John Llodra UBS Warburg Energy, LLC 82 Smith Street Groton, MA 01450

Bob Trejo UBS 677 Washington Blvd. Stamford, CT 06901

Steve Sheppard DTE Energy Trading 414 S. Main St., Suite 200 Ann Arbor, MI 48104

D. Michael Cornwell Dominion Retail, Inc. 120 Tredegar Street Richmond, VA 23219

William Barkas Dominion Retail, Inc. 625 Liberty Ave., 21st Floor Pittsburgh, PA 15222

Gary Ferenz
Conectiv Energy Supply Inc.
Christiana Bldg.
252 Chapman Road
P. O. Box 6066
Newark, DE 19714-6066

Katharine Olinchak Conectiv Power Delivery 401 Eagle Run Rd. PO Box 9239 Newark, DE 19714-9239

Rose Burke Conectiv Energy Supply Inc. Christiana Bldg. 252 Chapman Road P. O. Box 6066 Newark, DE 19714-6066

Maria Robinson Con Edison Energy 701 Westchester Avenue Suite 201 West White Plains, NY 10604

Board of Public Utilities I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service for the Period Beginning June 1, 2009 Docket No. ER08050310 Service List

Stephen Wemple Con Edison Energy 701 Westchester Avenue Suite 201 West White Plains, NY 10604

Igor Gonta J. Aron & Co. 85 Broad Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10004

Christian Hnat Edison Mission Marketing & Trading 160 Federal Street, 4th Floor Boston, MA 02110

Robert Viola Edison Mission Mktg. & Trading 160 Federal Street, 4th Floor Boston, MA 02110

Gordon Sanderson Suez Energy Marketing NA 1990 Post Oak Blvd. Suite 1900 Houston, TX 77056-3831

Ira Megdal Cozen, O'Connor Libertyview, St. 300 457 Haddonfield Road P.O. Box 5459 Cherry Hill, NJ 08002-2220

Stephen J. Humes McCarter & English CityPlace 1 Hartford, CT 06103

Grace Kurdian McCarter & English 245 Park Ave. New York, NY 10167

Jim Laskey Norris, McLaughlin & Marcus, P.A. 721 Route 202-206 Bridgewater, NJ 08807

MARKETERS
Roger Schwartz
RESA
Issues Management LLC
101 Poor Farm Road
Princeton, New Jersey 08540

Irene Prezelj FirstEnergy Solutions 395 Ghent Rd., Ste. 408 Akron, OH 44333

Kevin Laguardia Amerada Hess Corporation One Hess Plaza Woodbridge, NJ 07095

Stephen Fernands Customized Energy Solutions (for AES New Energy) 215 South Broad Street, 10th Fl. Philadelphia, PA 19107

Sara O'Neill Constellation NewEnergy 810 7th Ave., Ste. 400 New York, NY 10019

Steven Gabel Gabel Associates 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904

John Holtz Green Mountain Energy Co. 3000 Atrium Way Mail Box 275 Mount Laurel, NJ 08054

Paul Dwyer Green Mountain Energy Co. 123 Bloomingdale Ave. Suite 202 Wayne, PA 19087

Jay Kooper Amerada Hess Corp. One Hess Plaza Woodbridge, NJ 07095

Tom Michelman Senior Professional - XENERGY 3 Burlington Woods - 4th Floor Burlington, MA 01803-4543

Lisa Ferguson
Duke Energy North America
5400 Westheimer Court
Houston, TX 77056

Michael G. Briggs Reliant Resources, Inc. 801 Pennsylvania Ave. NW Washington, DC 20004-2604 SueAnne I. Harrel Pepco Energy Services 101 Castle Pointe Blvd. Piscataway, NJ 08854

Dana Swieson EPEX 102 Pickering Way, Suite 102 Exton, PA 19341-1330

Dale Kanterman, VP Eastern Energy Services 60 Fostertown Road Medford, NJ 08055

Marc Hanks Select Energy, Inc. 107 Selden Street Berlin, CT 06037

Tom Kinnane Direct Energy 3 Bethesda Metro Center st. 700 7450 Wisconsin Ave. Bethesda, MD 20814

Kristin A. Kreuder Xenergy 595 Summer Street, Suite 300 Stamford, CT 06901

Pamela Melton Strategic Energy LLC PO Box 44-449 Ft. Washington. MD 20749

OTHER PARTIES
Jack Johnson
President
Geophonic, Inc.
P.O.Box 580
Summit, NJ 07901

Nathaniel Greene NRDC 40 W. 20th Street, 11th fl. New York, NY 10011

Sara Bluhm NJBIA 102 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608-1199

Melanie Willoughby, VP NJBIA 102 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608-1199

Board of Public Utilities I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service for the Period Beginning June 1, 2009 Docket No. ER08050310 Service List

Stephen Dilts Director/Government Affairs Chemical Industry Council of New Jersey 150 W. State Street Trenton, NJ 08608

Kate McNamara
Delaware River Port Authority
Port Authority Transit Corp.
One Port Center
2 Riverside Drive
Camden, NJ 08101

Marvin Spira Food Policy Institute 71 Lipman Drive New Brunswick, NJ 08901

Jack O'Connor Rutgers Food Policy Institute ASB III, 3 Rutgers Plaza New Brunswick, NJ 08901

Richard Santoro NJ Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 W. State Street Trenton, NJ 08618

James Benton NJ Petroleum Council 150 W. State Street Trenton, NJ 08608

David Gillespie NJ Transit One Penn Plaza East Newark, NJ 07105-2246

Linda Doherty NJ Food Council 30 W. Lafayette St. Trenton, NJ 08608

Gregory Lawrence McDermott Will & Emery 28 State Street Boston, MA 02109-1775

Paul Forshay Sutherland Asbill & Brennan 1275 Pennsylvania Ave. NW Washington, DC 20004-2415

Steven S. Goldenberg, Esq. Fox Rothschild 997 Lenox Drive, Bldg. 3 Lawrenceville, NJ 08648 Howard Thompson Russo Tumulty Nester Thompson & Kelly, LLP 240 Cedar Knolls Road, Suite 308 Cedar Knolls, NJ 07927

Daniel O'Hern, Jr. Becker Meisel, LLC The Galleria 2 Bridge Ave., Bldg. 1 Red Bank, NJ 07701

Murray Bevan Courter, Kobert, & Cohen, P.C. 1001 Rt. 517 Hackettstown, NJ 07840

James Laskey Norris McLaughlin & Marcus 721 Rt. 202-206 Bridgewater, NJ 08807

Dena Mottola NJPIRG 11 N. Willow Street Trenton, NJ 08608

Phyllis Salowe-Kaye NJ Citizen Action 433 Market St. Suite 201 Camden, NJ 08102