

Agenda Date: 2/10/17 Agenda Item: 2A

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

**ENERGY** 

)

)

IN THE MATTER OF THE PROVISION OF BASIC GENERATION SERVICE FOR THE PERIOD BEGINNING JUNE 1, 2017 DECISION AND ORDER

DOCKET NO. ER16040337

Parties of Record:

**Gregory Eisenstark, Esq.,** Windels Marx Lane & Mittendorf, LLP, on behalf of Jersey Central Power & Light Company

Hesser McBride, Esq., Attorney for Public Service Electric and Gas Company Philip J. Passanante, Esq., Associate General Counsel for Atlantic City Electric Company Margaret Comes, Esq., Senior Attorney for Rockland Electric Company Chantale LaCasse, BGS Auction Manager, NERA Economic Consulting Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel Holly Reed, Gabel Associates, on behalf of IEPNJ

BY THE BOARD:

By Order dated October 31, 2016 in this docket, the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("Board") approved the joint Basic Generation Service ("BGS") proposal of Public Service Electric and Gas Company ("PSE&G"), Jersey Central Power & Light Company ("JCP&L"), Atlantic City Electric Company ("ACE") and Rockland Electric Company ("Rockland") (collectively the "EDCs"), for two descending clock auctions to secure the EDCs' BGS electricity requirements for the period beginning June 1, 2017 ("October 31, 2016 Order"). In an attempt to mitigate the risk to ratepayers, the Board directed the EDCs to procure approximately one-third of the EDCs' BGS residential small commercial customers ("BGS-RSCP") load for a 36-month period through a single clearing price for each EDC's BGS supply requirements in the auction.<sup>1</sup> The Board also found that a 12-month procurement period for the EDCs' hourly load BGS commercial and industrial energy pricing customers ("BGS-CIEP") is appropriate and reasonable. In the October 31, 2016 Order, the Board also committed to review the results of the BGS-RSCP Auction and the BGS-CIEP Auction (collectively the "BGS Auctions" or "Auctions") each in its entirety and certify the results of each auction for all of the EDCs, or for none of them, no later than the second business day after the last Auction closes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Approximately two-thirds of the EDCs' BGS-FP requirements are already under contract through May 31, 2018, and one-third through May 31, 2019 as a result of the 2015 and 2016 BGS-RSCP Auctions.

The results of the BGS Auctions, when approved by the Board, will then be converted into revised BGS rates for customers beginning June 1, 2017. This is the sixteenth year the Board has authorized a similar auction process to secure BGS supply.

The Auction Manager responsible for conducting the 2017 Auctions was National Economic Research Associates ("NERA"). NERA brings expertise in the conduct of simultaneous descending clock auctions in the energy and telecommunications industries, and has been the Auction Manager for the sixteen BGS Auctions. The 2017 Auctions were continuously monitored by Board Staff from the Division of Energy, as well as by the Board's consultant, Bates White, LLC<sup>2</sup> ("Bates White"). Bates White was retained to assist the Board in this process. Bates White has experience with simultaneous descending clock auctions and energy industry experience.

### **BGS-RSCP AUCTION SUMMARY**

The BGS-RSCP Auction began on February 6, 2017 and ended on February 7, 2017 after 19 rounds with all of the EDCs' 53 tranches<sup>3</sup> secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

EDC	Closing Price <u>¢/Kwh</u>	Total Tranches <u>Secured</u>
ACE	7.549	8
JCP&L	6.908	15
PSE&G	9.078	28
Rockland	8.050	2

A list of the BGS-RSCP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

### **BGS-CIEP AUCTION SUMMARY**

The BGS-CIEP Auction began on February 3, 2017, and ended on February 6, 2017 after 25 rounds with all of the EDCs' 43 tranches<sup>4</sup> secured, with the following closing prices for each EDC:

EDC	Closing Price <u>\$/Mw-day</u>	Total Tranches <u>Secured</u>
ACE	217.00	5
JCP&L	218.00	12
PSE&G	276.83	25
Rockland	223.61	1

A list of the BGS-CIEP Auction winners is included in Attachment A to this Order.

<sup>3</sup> A tranche in the BGS-RSCP Auction is approximately 100 Mw.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The original contract for consulting services was entered into by the Board in 2013 with Boston Pacific, LLC ("Boston Pacific"). In November 2016, Boston Pacific was acquired by Bates White.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> A tranche in the BGS-CIEP Auction is equivalent to approximately 75 Mw.

# **BGS AUCTION OVERSIGHT**

NERA has provided a confidential post-Auction checklist form evaluating how the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions were conducted. NERA's analysis supporting acceptance of the Auction results indicates, in part, that:

- no issues or questions were left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created uncertainty for bidders;
- neither procedural problems nor errors were observed during the Auctions; all communication protocols were followed;
- neither hardware nor software problems with the Auctions and communication systems were observed;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- all guidelines for setting or changing the Auction parameters were followed;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions in a material manner;
- communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there was no evidence that bidders were rushed;
- no complaints were received from the bidders;
- the Auctions were carried out in a fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of collusion or gaming by the bidders;
- public and sensitive information were treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions that materially affected the Auctions; and
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Bates White has also provided the Board with a confidential post-Auction evaluation form for the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions, as well as a supplemental checklist reviewing how the Auctions were conducted. Bates White's analysis is consistent with NERA's analysis. Both consultants recommend that the Board accept the final Auction results.

## **BGS AUCTION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS**

The independent NERA and Bates White analyses are consistent with each other and indicate that the Auctions proceeded without meaningful interruption, according to the Board-approved Auction Rules, in an acceptably fair and transparent manner, and they both recommend that the Board certify the Auction results. Staff assigned to oversee the Auctions has also briefed the Board on the conduct and results of each Auction.

After reviewing the checklists and evaluation forms from NERA and Bates White, and discussing the results and conduct of the Auctions with Staff, NERA and Bates White, the Board <u>FINDS</u> that:

- all bidders had sufficient information to prepare for the Auctions;
- information was generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable, and the timetable was adjusted appropriately as needed;
- there were no Auction issues or questions left unresolved prior to the Auctions that created material uncertainty for bidders;
- from what could be observed, there were neither procedural problems nor errors with the Auctions, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols between bidders and the Auction Manager were adhered to;
- appropriate data back-up procedures were planned and carried out;
- no security breaches were observed during the Auction process;
- from what could be observed, communication protocols among the EDCs, NERA, Staff, the Board, and Bates White were followed during the Auctions;
- protocols were followed for decisions regarding changes in the Auction parameters (e.g. volume, load cap, bid decrements);
- the calculations (e.g. for bid decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the Auction software were double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager;
- there was no evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the Auctions;
- from what could be observed, the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders was timely and effective;
- there were no complaints received from the bidders about the process;
- the Auctions were carried out in an acceptably fair and transparent manner;
- there was no evidence of gaming on the part of bidders;
- there was no evidence of collusion among bidders;
- information was made public in an appropriate manner and, from what could be observed, sensitive information was treated appropriately;
- there were no factors exogenous to the Auctions (e.g., changes in market environment) that materially affected the Auctions in unanticipated ways);
- there are no concerns with the Auctions' outcome with regard to any specific EDC(s);
- the Auctions appear to have generated a result that is consistent with competitive bidding, market-determined prices, and efficient allocation of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP loads.

Based on the foregoing, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>CERTIFIES</u> the final results of the BGS-RSCP and BGS-CIEP Auctions in their entirety, and subsequently <u>APPROVES</u> the closing prices for each EDC. Furthermore, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>ORDERS</u> the EDCs: 1) to execute the necessary documents with the winning bidders, including the BGS Supplier Master Agreements; 2) to implement the BGS rates resulting from the Auctions beginning June 1, 2017; and 3) to file tariff sheets reflecting those rates by March 24, 2017.

Consistent with past Board practice, the Board is releasing the names of the winning bidders at this time. However, at this time, the Board will not release the specific tranche and service area details for each successful bidder, so as not to compromise the position of the winning bidders in the marketplace. The Board plans to make this additional information public prior to June 1, 2017.

DATED: Feb. 10, 2017

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

RICHARD S. MRQ

PRESIDENT

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER

DIANNE SOLOMON COMMISSIONER

Yang- Aara Holden

MARY-ANNA HOLDEN COMMISSIONER

UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

E. COVIE C) ACTING SECRETARY

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original

in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

### **ATTACHMENT A**

## I/M/O the Provision of Basic Generation Service For The Period Beginning June 1, 2017 Docket No. ER16040337

Auction Winners Approved by the Board of Public Utilities on February 10, 2017

### **BGS-RSCP Auction Winners**

BP Energy Company Calpine Energy Services LP DTE Energy Trading, Inc. Exelon Generation Company, LLC Engelhart Commodities Trading Partners<sup>5</sup> Macquarie Energy LLC NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC<sup>6</sup> Noble Americas Gas & Power Corp. PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC TransCanada Power Marketing Ltd.

### **BGS-CIEP Auction Winners**

ConocoPhillips Company DTE Energy Trading, Inc. Engelhart Commodities Trading Partners Exelon Generation Company, LLC NextEra Energy Power Marketing, LLC PSEG Energy Resources & Trade LLC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The company was formerly known as BTG Pactual Commodities S.A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Formerly NextEra Energy Power Marketing, LLC

# In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

## Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

Frank Mossburg Boston Pacific Company, Inc. 1100 New York Avenue, NW Suite 490 east Washington, DC 2005 fmossburg@bostonpacific.com

#### DIVISION OF RATE COUNSEL

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625 sbrand@rpa.state.nj.us

Ami Morita Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625 amorita@rpa.state.nj.us

Diane Schulze Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4th Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, New Jersey 08625 dschulze@rpa.state.nj.us

### PSE&G

Alexander C. Stern, Esq. Assistant General Regulatory Counsel Law Department 80 Park Plaza, T-05 Newark, New Jersey 07102-4194 <u>Alexander.Stern@nseg.com</u>

Terrence J. Moran Public Service Electric & Gas Co. 80 Park Plaza, T-13 Newark, NJ 07101 Terrence.Moran@pseg.com

### ATLANTIC CITY ELECTRIC CO.

Joseph F. Janocha, Manager, Regulatory Affairs Atlantic City Electric Co. – 63ML38 5100 Harding Highway Atlantic Regional Office Mays Landing, NJ 08330 joseph.janocha@pepcoholdings.com

Daniel A. Tudor Pepco Holdings, Inc. 701 Ninth Street NW Washington, DC 20068-0001 datudor@pepco.com

Philip J. Passanante, Assistant General Counsel Atlantic City Electric Co. - 89KS42 800 King Street, 5th Floor PO Box 231 Wilmington, DE 19899-0231 philip.passanante@pepcoholdings.com

#### JCP&L

Kevin Connelly First Energy 300 Madison Avenue Morristown, NJ 07960 kconnelly@firstenergycorp.com

Greg Eisenstark Windels Marx &Mittendorf, LLP 120 Albany Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor New Brunswick, NJ 08901 geisenstark@windelsmarx.com

Sally J Cheong First Energy 300 Madison Avenue P. O. Box 1911 Morristown, NJ 07962-1911 scheong@firstenergycorp.com

#### ROCKLAND

John L. Carley, Esq. Consolidated Edison Co. of NY Law Dept., Room 1815-S 4 Irving Place New York, NY 10003 carleyi@coned.com

James C. Meyer, Esq. Riker, Danzig, Scherer, Hyland & Perretti Headquarters Plaza One Speedwell Avenue Morristown, NJ 07962 imeyer@riker.com

William A. Atzl, Jr. Rockland Electric Company 4 Irving Place - 2nd Floor SE New York, NY 10003 atzlw@coned.com

Margaret Comes, Esq., Consolidated Edison Co. of NY Law Department, Room 1815-S 4 Irving Place New York, NY 10003 comesm@coned.com

### NERA

Gene Meeban NERA Economic Consulting 1255 23<sup>rd</sup> St. NW Washington, DC 20037 <u>Gene.Mechan@NERA.com</u>

Chantale LaCasse NERA Economic Consulting 1255 23<sup>rd</sup> St. NW Washington, DC 20037 <u>Chantale, LaCasse@NERA.com</u>

### BPU

Irene Kim Asbury, Secretary New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Irene.Asbury@bpu.nj.gov

Richard DeRose New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 <u>Richard DeRose@bpu.nj.gov</u>

Jerome May, Director New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Jerome.may@bpu.nj.gov

Mark Beyer, Chief Economist New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 mark beyer@bu.ni.gov

Bethany Rocque-Romaine, Esq. New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Bethany.Romaine@bpu.nj.gov

Stacy Peterson New Jersey Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 44 South Clinton Ave., 3rd Floor Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 stacy.neterson@bpu.nj.gov

### DAG

Andrew Kuntz, Esq. Deputy Attorney General Division of Law Board of Public Utilities Section 124 Halsey Street P.O. Box 45029 Newark, New Jersey 07101 Andrew.kuntz@lps.state.nj.us

#### **BPU's BGS CONSULTANTS**

Craig R. Roach Boston Pacific Company, Inc. 1100 New York Avenue, NW Suite 490 east Washington, DC 2005 croach@bostonpacific.com

## In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

## Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

#### THIRD PARTY SUPPLIERS

Murray E. Bevin, Esq. Bevan, Mosca, Giuditta & Zarillo, P.C. 776 Mountain Blvd. Suite 202 Watchung, NJ 07069 mbcvan@bmgzlaw.com

SueAnne I. Harrel Pepco Energy Services 39 Crestview Drive Asset Mgmt Group Clinton, NJ 08809 sharrel@pepcoenergy.com

Dana Swieson EPEX 717 Constitution Drive Suite 110 Exton, PA 19341 Dana, swieson@cpex.cc

Marc A. Hanks Senior Manager, Government & Regulatory Affairs Direct Energy Services, LLC Marc Hanks@directenergy.com

Mark S. Kumm Pepco Energy Services, Inc. 1300 N. 17th, Suite 1600 Arlington, VA 22209 mkumm@pepcoenergy.com

Stacey Rantala National Energy Marketers Association 3333 K Street, N.W., Suite 110 Washington, D.C. 20007 srantala@energymarketers.com

David B. Applebaum Director, Regulatory Affairs NextEra Energy Resources, LLC 21 Pardee Place Ewing, New Jersey 08628 david.applebaum@nexterachergy.com

David Gil Manager, Regulatory Affairs NextEra Energy Resources, LLC 700 Universe Boulevard Juno Beach, Florida 33408 david,gil@nexteraenergy.com

Kathleen Maher Constellation NewEnergy 810 Seventh Avenue, Suite 400 New York, NY 10019-5818 kathleen.maher@constellation.com Bob Blake VP Elec. Operations & Regulatory Affairs MXenergy 10010 Junction Dr, Suite 104S Annapolis Junction, MD 20701 rblake@mxenergy.com

#### NJLEUC

Paul F. Forshay, Partner SUTHERLAND 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-2415 paul.forshay@sutherland.com

Steven S. Goldenberg, NJLEUC, Esq. Fox Rothschild LLP Princeton Corporate Center 997 Lenox Drive, BLDG. 3 Lawrenceville, NJ 08648-2311 SGoldenberg@foxrothschild.com

### **BGS SUPPLIERS**

Steven Gabel - IEPNJ Gabel Associates 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 steven@gabelassociates.com

James Laskey, Esq. - IEPNJ Norris McLaughlin & Marcus 721 Route 202-206 Bridgewater, NJ 08807 jlaskey@mmlaw.com

Mark Baird, Director, Regulatory Affairs RRI Energy, Inc. 7642 West 450 North Sharpsville, IN 46068 mbaird@rrienergy.com

Raymond Depillo PSEG Energy Resources & Trade 80 Park Plaza, T-19 P.O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 raymond.depillo@pseg.com

Shawn P. Leyden, Esq. PSEG Energy Resources & Trade 80 Park Plaza, T-19 P. O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 shawn.leyden@pseg.com David K Richter, Esq. PSEG Regulatory Department 80 Park Plaza, T-5C P. O. Box 570 Newark, NJ 07101 david richter@pseg.com

Ken Gfroerer RRI Energy RRI Box 246 Stahlstown, PA 15687 kgfroerer@rrienergy.com

Craig S. Blume Director, Power Marketing UGI Energy Services / UGI Development Company One Meridian Boulevard, Suite 2C01 Wyomissing, PA 19610 cblume@ugies.com

Robert O'Connell, VP & Compliance Manager J.P. Morgan Ventures Energy Corp. 1033 Squires Drive West Chester, PA, 19382 robert.oconnell@jpmorgan.com

Deborah Hart, Vice President Morgan Stanley Capital Group 2000 Westchester Avenue Trading Floor Purchase, NY 10577 <u>deborah.hart@morganstanley.com</u>

Marcia Hissong, Director, Contract Administration/Counsel DTE EnergyTrading, Inc. 414 South Main Street Suite 200 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 hissongm@dteenergy.com

Don Hubschman American Electric Power 155 W. Nationwide Blvd. Columbus, OH 43215 dmhubschman@aepes.com

Christine McGarvey AEP Energy Partners, Inc. Energy Trader 155 W Nationwide Blvd Suite 500 Columbus, OH 43215 clmcgarvey@acpes.com In the Matter of the Provision of Basic Generation Service For the Period Beginning June 1, 2017

## Docket No. ER16040337 Service List

Glenn Riepl AEP Energy Services 1 Riverside Plaza 14th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-2373 gfriepl@acp.com

Jean-Paul St. Germain Sempra Energy Trading 58 Commerce Road Stamford, CT 06902 jean-paul.st.germain@rbssempra

Howard O. Thompson - BGS Russo Tumulty Nester Thompson Kelly, LLP 240 Cedar Knolls Road Suite 306 Cedar Knolls, NJ 07927 httpompson@russotumulty.com

Sharon Weber PPL Energy Plus 2 North 3rd Street TW 20 Allentown, PA 18101 siweber@pplweb.com

Stephen Wemple Con Edison Energy 701 Westchester Avenue Suite 201 West White Plains, NY 10604 wemples@conedenergy.com

Glen Thomas The P<sup>3</sup> Group GT Power Group LLC 1060 First Avenue Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406 Gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Divesh Gupta Senior Counsel Constellation Energy 100 Constellation Way, Suite 500C Baltimore, Maryland 21202 divesh.gupta@constellation.com

Tom Hoatson LS Power Development, LLC 2 Tower Center East Brunswick, NJ 08816 thoatson@lspower.com

John Citrolo Conectiv Energy Supply, Inc. PO Box 6066, MS 92DC69 Newark, DE 19714 john.citrolo@conectiv.com

Adam Kaufman Executive Director Independent Energy Producers of NJ Five Vaughn Drive, Suite 101 Princeton, NJ 08540 akaufman@kzgrp.com Stuart Ormsbee TransCanada Power Marketing Ltd. 110 Turnpike Road, Suite 300 Westborough, MA 01581 Stuart ormsbee@transcanada.com

Gregory K. Lawrence Cadwalader, Wickersham & Taft LLP One World Financial Center New York, NY 10281 ureg.lawrence@cwt.com

Victoria M. Lauterbach Cadwalader, Wickersham & Taft LLP 700 Sixth Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20001 tory.lauterbach@cwt.com

Anthony Pietranico ConEdison Solutions Inc. Electricity Supply Specialist Tel: 732-741-5822 x204 pietranicoa@conedsolutions.com

Aundrea Williams Director Regulatory Affairs NextEra Power Marketing LLC 700 Universe Boulevard Juno Beach, Fl. 33408 aundrea.williams@nexteraenergyservices.com

Ira G. Megdal Cozen O'Connor 457 Haddonfield Road Suite 300 P.O. Box 5459 Cherry Hill, NJ 08002 imegdal@cozen.com

Christi L. Nicolay Division Director Macquarie Energy LLC 500 Dallas St., Level 31 Houston, TX 77002 Christi.Nicolay@macquarie.com

#### **OTHER PARTIES**

Sara Bluhm NJBIA 102 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08608-1199 sbluhm@nibia.org

John Holub NJ Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618 John@njrma.org

Judy Misoyianis, Administrator New Jersey Retail Merchants Assoc. 332 West State Street Trenton, NJ 08618 judy.njrma@verizon.net Holly Minogue Gabel Associates Energy, Environmental, and Public Utility Consulting 417 Denison Street Highland Park, NJ 08904 holly.minogue@gabelassociates.com

Larry Spielvogel, PE L. G. Spielvogel, Inc. 190 Presidential Blvd # 310 Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004-1151 spielvogel@comcast.net

Robert Macksoud, Jr, CEP Director Energy Procurement EnergySolve One Executive Dr, Suite 401 Somerset, NJ 08873 rmacksoud@energysolve.com

Lyle Rawlings Mid-Atlantic Solar Energy Industries Association Rutgers EcoComplex, Suite 208-B 1200 Florence-Columbus Road, Bordentown, NJ 08505 Irawlings@mseia..nct

Katie Bolcar Mid-Atlantic Director Solar Energy Industries Association 575 7th Street, NW, Suite 400, Washington DC 20005 kbolcan@scia.org

Bruce H. Burcat, Esq. Executive Director Mid-Atlantic Renewable Energy Coalition 208 Stonegate Way Camden, DE 19934 bburcat@marcc.us